

BROOKLYN

CONNECTIONS

**CLAIM &
COUNTERCLAIM
LESSON PLAN**

AIM:	Students will use primary source documents to identify claims and counterclaims.
OBJECTIVE:	<p>Students will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Learn how to define both claim and counterclaim • Practice making strong claims and strong counterclaims • Analyze informational texts • Locate evidence • Practice defending claims and evidence with solid reasoning
MATERIALS:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Claim and Counterclaim Handout • Primary Source(s) • Claim and Counterclaim prezi: http://prezi.com/pc2vof75xeum/?utm_campaign=share&utm_medium=copy&rc=ex0share
PROCEDURE:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Warm-up: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Ask students to define claim <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Claim: something you believe. Note: claims don't have to be true b. Ask students to define counterclaim <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Counterclaim: An opposing viewpoint; something said to offset someone else's claim. Note: a counterclaim is not necessarily the converse, simply a different opinion. ie. Cars are the most important form of transportation vs. busses vs. airplanes vs. boats. 2. Group Practice: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Practice making claims using popular characters: Harry Potter vs. Katniss Everdeen, Jay-Z vs. Beyoncé, etc. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Educator will try to maintain order, getting a clear claim and then soliciting a clear counterclaim. ii. Encourage students to provide a reason for their claim; any reason will do, "Because Katniss is a girl" is an acceptable reason for this portion of the activity. b. Ask students: How do scholars support claims? Discuss the importance of evidence c. Return to original debate and ask students to think of ways they could support their claims with strong evidence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Jay-Z vs. Beyoncé: who has more awards? ii. Harry Potter vs. Katniss: which series made more money? 3. Independent Practice: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Present students with a primary source document that has a clear claim and counterclaim - pro/con. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. The attached document is from the Girls High School Record, a student newspaper. Opinion columns in newspapers are helpful places to look. ii. You may also use multiple documents that discuss the same issue. b. Students will identify a claim and counterclaim. Students will locate evidence to support each claim. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. The Girls High School Record can be cut up into individual squares. Students will place each response under the correct claim (pro/con) and then pull evidence from the text. d. Once students have located evidence for both claims, they will choose the claim they think is the strongest and, along with two pieces of strong evidence, document it on the front of their handout. e. Students must defend their evidence choice and present their reasoning. Reasoning is when students explain how and why their evidence supports their claim by providing analysis, acknowledgement of connections between ideas, etc.

	<p>4. Debate</p> <p>a. Ask a student to state their claim, their evidence, and their reasoning.</p>
--	---

	<p>b. Ask if any students disagree with that claim, can counter that evidence, or see a flaw in the reasoning.</p> <p>c. Continue, exploring different ways students supported their claims.</p>
C.C.S.S. ADDRESSED:	<p>4th Grade CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RL.4.1 Refer to details and examples in a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when drawing inferences from the text. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.4.6 Compare and contrast a firsthand and secondhand account of the same event or topic; describe the differences in focus and the information provided. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.4.9 Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.4.4 Report on a topic or text, tell a story, or recount an experience in an organized manner, using appropriate facts and relevant, descriptive details to support main ideas or themes; speak clearly at an understandable pace.</p> <p>5th Grade CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RL.5.1 Quote accurately from a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when drawing inferences from the text. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.5.6 Analyze multiple accounts of the same event or topic, noting important similarities and differences in the point of view they represent. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.5.9 Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.5.4 Report on a topic or text or present an opinion, sequencing ideas logically and using appropriate facts and relevant, descriptive details to support main ideas or themes; speak clearly at an understandable pace.</p> <p>6th Grade CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.6.9 Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.6.4 Present claims and findings, sequencing ideas logically and using pertinent descriptions, facts, and details to accentuate main ideas or themes; use appropriate eye contact, adequate volume, and clear pronunciation. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.WHST.6-8.1a Introduce claim(s) about a topic or issue, acknowledge and distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and organize the reasons and evidence logically. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.WHST.6-8.1b Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources.</p> <p>7th Grade CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.7.9 Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.7.4 Present claims and findings, emphasizing salient points in a focused, coherent manner with pertinent descriptions, facts, details, and examples; use appropriate eye contact, adequate volume, and clear pronunciation. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.WHST.6-8.1a Introduce claim(s) about a topic or issue, acknowledge and distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and organize the reasons and evidence logically. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.WHST.6-8.1b Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources.</p>

8th Grade

CSS.ELA-Literacy.W.8.9 Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.8.4 Present claims and findings, emphasizing salient points in a focused, coherent manner with relevant evidence, sound valid reasoning, and well-chosen details; use appropriate eye contact, adequate volume, and clear pronunciation.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.WHST.6-8.1a Introduce claim(s) about a topic or issue, acknowledge and distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and organize the reasons and evidence logically.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.WHST.6-8.1b Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources.

9th – 10th Grades

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RL.9-10.1 Cite the textual evidence that most strongly supports an analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.9-10.1 Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.9-10.1a Introduce precise claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that establishes clear relationships among claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.9-10.1b Develop claim(s) and counterclaims fairly, supplying evidence for each while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both in a manner that anticipates the audience's knowledge level and concerns.

11th- 12th Grades

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RL.11-12.1 Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text, including determining where the text leaves matters uncertain

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.11-12.1 Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.11-12.1a Introduce precise, knowledgeable claim(s), establish the significance of the claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that logically sequences claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.11-12.1b Develop claim(s) and counterclaims fairly and thoroughly, supplying the most relevant evidence for each while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both in a manner that anticipates the audience's knowledge level, concerns, values, and possible biases.

INQUIRING REPORTER

By CLAIRE KIFFERSTEIN



Tomorrow, Regents' week begins, and for all those who happen to be taking them, the studying is over. This timely question arises, "Do you think Regents examinations are of

any value?"

PRO

Yetta Dunn—Div. 8

"Regents are very useful in that they help collect one's knowledge. Even if a student plans to enter the business world, she must learn how to take a test with poise and calm. In order to get a job you must take a variety of tests and it is best to get experience in this ordeal of test-taking."

Janet Spencer—Div. 7

"Regents are valuable as a review, which would probably never be accomplished if these examinations weren't required. Very few would review if it weren't an absolute necessity. These exams also set a standard of requirements used by colleges so that entrance exams need not be taken by those that have a Regents Certificate."

Barbara Samson—Div. 7

"These examinations provide the necessary check up that one needs at the end of the term. It also sets a minimum amount of work that a class must cover. New York State has the reputation of having one of the finest educational systems, and Regents may very well have something to do with this."

CON

Isma Jacobs—Div. 8

"Regents are really of no value. Girls that know how to cram in the right manner can pass. However, some of the students that may have worked all term become nervous and do not do as well as they should. Therefore, if the wrong girls pass, of what use are Regents?"

Zelda Ginsberg—Div. 6

"There are certain students that just pass their class work all along and then when the crucial moment comes they fail and therefore have to stay back a whole term to take their Regents over again. Also, more than half of the girls do not go to college and really do not need Regents credit."

Gloria E. Rubin—Div. 6

"Many students become frightened when they take tests and, therefore, these exams are not real tests of their ability. Also, there are students that go to out of town colleges and therefore they do not need Regents credit. It is useless to make people take tests when there is no real need for them."

Shirley Meinhold—Div. 7

"I do not think that Regents are of any more value than any other test given in class. It is not fair to rely on one test to determine a student's ability. It is also a well-known fact that some Regents are very hard while others are comparatively easy. It is unfair to the average student to give her an unusually difficult test, because she won't pass, or at least won't get as good a mark as she expects; on the other hand, a test that is too easy is not a proper test."

CLAIM AND COUNTERCLAIM

Look at the article from *Girls High Record*. What is one claim you can identify?

List two pieces of evidence in support of this claim:

1.

2.

What counterclaim can you find?

List two pieces of evidence in support of this counterclaim:

1.

2.
